

ACADEMIC DISHONESTY - DR. SHABBIR AHMED

CLAIM: ONLY CAMELS CAN BE SACRIFICED

The articles on this website may be reproduced freely as long as the following source reference is provided:

Joseph A Islam www.quransmessage.com

سَلَامٌ عَلَيْكُمْ

Salamun Alaikum (Peace be upon you)

Joseph A Islam

Copyright © 2009 Joseph A Islam: Article last modified 15th November 2011

Dr. Shabbir asserts in a public forum that only '**camels**' (exclusively) can be sacrificed during Hajj.

...

Udhiya = Qurbani = Animal Sacrifice. Blood sacrifice is strictly a Pagan and Biblical ritual supposed to please God. He does not prescribe it at all. Only camels may be slaughtered at Hajj, and only in Makkah for the pilgrims to host one another (22:36). NAHR strictly refers to the sacrifice of a camel. [1]

...

His claim of exclusivity **for camel sacrifice** is also resonated in **his rendition of the Quran, the QXP**.

[2]

I advanced a challenge to Dr. Shabbir's understanding of the requirement to slaughter camels exclusively. Please see below:

Dr. Shabbir.

On the strength of 22:36, you say:

"Only camels may be slaughtered at Hajj, and only in Makkah for the pilgrims to host one another (22:36). NAHR strictly refers to the sacrifice of a camel"

Where do you get this interpretation from 22:36?

The Arabic word used by the Quran is 'budna'. 'bud'na' is plural of 'badanah' and comes from 'badan' which means **body without arms legs or a cow, goat, bull, camel or any animals of sacrifice.**

So to say only camels can be slaughtered on the strength of 22:36 is untenable in my opinion and from an Arabic perspective. It means all sacrificial animals.

Salaam. [3]

I further clarified my contention with Dr. Shabbir's rendition in the following post to another member.

Salamun Alaikum.

Saba is correct, my main contention was with 22:36 and the use of 'bud'na' which is not a reference to camels **'exclusively'**. Saba is also correct that the Quran makes use of 'jimaltun' and 'naqatu' for camels. This is **not** the word used in 22:36.

Furthermore, the word **'Nahr'** which is incidentally not found in 22:36 also does **not** refer to slaughtering 'camels **'exclusively'**. With respect, to assert as Dr. Shabbir has done that **"NAHR strictly refers to the sacrifice of a camel"** is an incorrect statement. Readers can research this for themselves and speak with Arabic speaking scholars if they deem fit.

The word 'Nahr' means to slaughter / sacrifice a camel generally but **includes** other beasts such as cows and bulls as well. The Taj ul-Urus actually confirms that these beasts were brought as offerings to Makkah.

The verb 'Nahara' is only found once in the Quran and that is in verse 108.2.

Peace. [4]

Dr. Shabbir was clearly not willing to reconsider his understanding in light of the academic challenge, yet further asserted that 'al-budna' was one of the **700 words for a camel**.

Dear brother,

Al-budna is one of the 700 words for camel. You may stick to your word since I never enter an argument.

22:36 And the camels! We have appointed them among the symbols (of obedience) to God; in them is much good for you. (They carry you and your loads and then help you host one another.) So, dedicate them to God's Name when they are drawn up in lines (for slaughter during Hajj). And after they have fallen to the ground lifeless, partake from their flesh, and feed the contented poor who do not beg as well as the poor who ask. Remember that God has subjected these animals to you so that you may be grateful.

[Al-budna = Camels] [5]

My response to his post clarified my academic contention and sought a further response to Dr. Shabbir's second claim that there were 700 words for a camel in Arabic.

Dr Shabbir.

I raised a point which I think is important for clarification. 'Al-budna' is not an **exclusive** term for a camel nor is 'nahr' which is a statement **you** have made.

You are also entitled to keep your opinion. However, it may be of interest to other readers who wish to learn the **true remit of the words**.

Also, your statement "Al-budna is one of the 700 words for camel."

Please enlighten me if you will of the 700 words.

Peace. [6]

FINAL THOUGHTS

Dr. Shabbir hitherto has failed to acknowledge the contention against his unwarranted claims and has not advanced any suitable verifiable evidence to support his understanding.

REFERENCES

- [1] [online] <http://www.salaatforum.com/index.php?id=164> [Accessed 15th November 2011]
- [2] AHMED. S, QXPiv, The Quran as it Explains Itself, 4th Edition, August, 2008, Verses 22:36; 108:2.
- [3] [online] <http://www.salaatforum.com/index.php?id=185> [Accessed 15th November 2011], typo corrected from original post: strength to: strength
- [4] [online] <http://www.salaatforum.com/index.php?id=217> [Accessed 15th November 2011], typo corrected from original post: slaughtering to: slaughtering
- [5] [online] <http://www.salaatforum.com/index.php?id=225> [Accessed 15th November 2011]
- [6] [online] <http://www.salaatforum.com/index.php?id=227> [Accessed 15th November 2011], typo corrected from original post: entitled to: entitled

[Joseph Islam](#)

© 2010 Quransmessage.com All Rights Reserved